



## SCIENTIFIC FINAL REPORT

### Two- and three-year projects and postdoctoral projects

Regnr Östersjöstiftelsen: A018-2009

Project manager: Rebecka Lettevall

Project title: East of Cosmopolis: The World Citizen and the paradox of the sans-papiers

#### 1. The three most important results of the project and what conclusions can be drawn from them

It is a fundamental result that actors who have expressed cosmopolitan ideas, such as those who have sought to create a peaceful community or a cosmopolitan citizenship, have referred to cosmopolitan thought-sets from the long intellectual tradition (Greek antiquity, Christianity and the Enlightenment). Still, long-lived cosmopolitan key concepts (e.g., humanity, peace, rights, citizenship, civilization) have been reshaped, and the timing and spacing of the use of concepts have clearly been affected by local and national contexts. Of importance is how concepts in different settings have been linked to or detached from other isms, such as internationalism, universalism, pacifism, patriotism, communism, capitalism and imperialism. Also, in settings where cosmopolitan key concepts have been used, more specific ism-variants (neutralism) or new isms (mondialism) have developed.

That leads to the fact that new concepts also have developed within the cluster of long-lived cosmopolitan concepts. In a post-war political movement, which sought to replace nation-states with a world-wide state, the new terms *mondialism* and *mondialist* (1950s) came to replace the terms cosmopolitanism (from the 18<sup>th</sup> century) and cosmopolitan (from antiquity). At the same time, the movement's members declared that they were *världsmedborgare* (world citizens) and they both explicitly and implicitly referred to the cosmopolitan tradition. Thorough research on mondialism is internationally new for only a few years, so this finding is an important contribution to the research of cosmopolitanism.

It is also shown, in studies of cosmopolitan projects in the political East-West tension, that the creation of political identities (cosmopolitan, European, national) needs to be understood in relation to multifaceted meanings of the notion of ideology. Of importance is how certain isms have been attributed ideological or negative meanings by actors. Thus, studies on cosmopolitanism have illuminated how the idea of ideology has evolved, ascribed multiple meanings, and been used in political controversies throughout time.

From these results, three main conclusions can be drawn. Not only cosmopolitanism but also the related concept of ideology needs in-depth and conceptual examination. Ideological misconceptions are easily reproduced if one does not consider how isms are similar and different from each other, and how the character of an ism is related to situated and changed meanings in the idea of ideology. Moreover, the cosmopolitan tradition is bound to other long-lived traditions, and these are characterized by a philosophical rather than an ideological character. Nevertheless, in 20<sup>th</sup> century cosmopolitan projects ideas from the cosmopolitan tradition have been shaped in more obvious ideological characters (in the meaning to act to preserve or change society). Also, multifaceted meanings in cosmopolitan key concepts demonstrate the need to only use cosmopolitanism as a methodological or theoretical tool in research if it is defined with awareness of how cosmopolitanism has been situated and changed through history. Such historical awareness can counteract not least anachronism, eurocentrism, and a centre-periphery dichotomization.



## **2. The project's contribution to the international research frontline**

In this research project, examinations of cosmopolitan projects in the Baltic Sea region have brought new results to the multidisciplinary research fields of cosmopolitanism and area studies. Social sciences rather than the humanities have been dominating these fields and, in some cases, it occurs that cosmopolitanism is burdened by ahistorical presumptions. Such problems, as anachronism, can underlie contemporary theoretical and methodological uses of cosmopolitanism. This project contributes to the contemporary multifaceted research and discussion about cosmopolitanism by exploring the historical and contextual depth in cosmopolitanism. Focus is shifted beyond Western imagination and the centre-periphery dichotomy by including Eastern Europe, redefining the Enlightenment legacy and problematizing the very idea of a cosmopolitan reason.

This project has examined relations between the intellectual past and present by focusing long-lived concepts in cosmopolitan projects in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. As is shown in this project, the idea of being a cosmopolitan has been topical in intervals – as in education and politics, and often with reference to the Enlightenment philosopher Immanuel Kant. To create a better world in a Kantian sense has for example been expressed in *Världsborgarrörelsen* (World Citizen Movement). *Världsborgare* (world citizens) mobilized in Sweden 1949–1968 and was part of a French mother movement. The movement represented the new ism *mondialism* and made the new concept *mondialist* a synonym to world citizen. The movement expressed new-thinking politics, but also actualized a Western legacy of cosmopolitanism (and is implicit eurocentrism). Of importance is that intense 20<sup>th</sup> century cosmopolitan periods are often dated to the end of the Cold War (and earlier to 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> centuries), but this study shows how cosmopolitan ideas had an intense world-wide political power in the aftermath of both the First and Second World Wars and during the Cold War. It should also be mentioned that in several studies (by Kaveh and later Gustafsson), Hannah Arendt's political thought has been problematized in relation to themes such as ethics, reason, the limits of citizenship and cosmopolitanism.

Furthermore, several studies have focused on grasping time and space in cosmopolitan concepts. Long-lived concepts such as cosmopolitan, state, citizen, nation, humanity, and peace have been revived and filled with new meanings in tandem with societal changes (political, cultural and conceptual). When such concepts are used it is often with reference to historical thinkers of cosmopolitanism: well-known, lesser known and anti-cosmopolitans. This is not least shown in contributions on how the terms cosmopolitan and peace have developed in Sweden. Concerning the former, research shows that the term cosmopolitan has been compatible with the idea of a patriot and with the Christian tradition, but also worked in controversy with the patriot (through nationalism) and parts of the Christian tradition. Another more concrete example of how the concept has been understood in new ways is from the interwar period, in the context of stateless refugees, where the practice of a cosmopolitan citizenship was expressed with the Nansen Passports.

Also, studies show how cosmopolitan key concepts (state, citizen, nation) have been clustered with others. For example, by focusing on the use of the concept of neutrality in spheres as science, politics, and culture in foremost neutral nations during the First World War and afterwards, it has been shown that neutrality in its turn was clustered with peace, internationalism, objectivity, rationality, civilization. Also, an ideology of neutralism developed through history and was later embraced by international organizations. This does not only give perspectives on the century by contrasting the narrative of great belligerent powers, but also adding insights to research about developments of ideologies and isms.

## **3. The contribution of the research to the knowledge of the Baltic Sea Region and Eastern Europe**

Examinations of cosmopolitan conceptual clusters in Eastern Europe have provided knowledge about ideologies and isms, and how literature has had a political power in processes of creating identities in the Baltic Sea Region. The research demonstrates the need to counteract the reproduction of ideological misconceptions – and contributes to our contemporary understanding of systemic crises, global integration, and contradictions in globalization.



A reconstruction of Gorbachev's concept of a *European home*, its philosophy of history and expression in the post-war debate, provides insights about the search for a common identity and the fall of communism. In that concept, the class struggle was overshadowed by "human values" and there was a rapprochement between communism and capitalism. It thus shows a shift from the traditional "anti-imperialist" Soviet outlook to a search for "universal consensus". This cosmopolitan universalism challenged also particularistic imperialist universalism. Still, the concept contained paradoxes and anachronisms that supported the dislocation of post-Soviet Russia from Europe, and Russia's place in a European home is discussed in relation to the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> century Russian ideology of so-called cosmism. The concept is also related to "kosmopolitizm", a word of abuse in a Russian context. Another examined concept is the post-communist *transition* which is traced to its intellectual prehistory and related to alternative notions and communist ideology. It was used in 1990s–2000s and appears as asymmetric and negatively charged, indicating absence and shortage. Also, it was in a dialectics of communist and post-communist transitology, and radical versions of teleological post-communist transitology especially, that an essentially communist conceptualization of change was reproduced.

The mentioned themes of isms and identity are also examined more generally in research about the Baltic Sea region as a historical and social space. Focus has been upon that area as a geographical and political space of division and unification, and studies show how culture had a power in the creation of national identities. It is discussed how culture, through literature, could transcend boundaries. The construction of national identities has been examined through transnational perspectives, and it is problematized how such perspectives are connected to cosmopolitanism and the global, as to nationalism and local patriotism. Also, in the study of *Världsmédborgarrörelsen* it is demonstrated how literature functioned as a political force in the creation of a cosmopolitan identity which in that case was polemic against national identity as well as to patriotism. Furthermore, world citizens oriented themselves in an ideological landscape where they portrayed both communism and capitalism as ideological, while their *mondialism* rather was presented as non-ideological.

#### **4. New research questions that the project has led to**

Research on peace actors in the East-West tensions could benefit in focusing upon isms, ideologies and time orientation. Important questions are: In what ways do X refer to historical cosmopolitan thought-sets, and how are cosmopolitanism related to other isms and shaped in an ideological character in its political mobilization? Which meanings of ideology are attributed by X, and what position towards ideology is expressed? The new theoretical tool *reaktopi* (reactopia) – which in the project has been developed in conjunction with Arendt's idea about temporality (memory – expectation) was added to Koselleck's work on conceptuality and temporality – can be used to display how political actors (other than *Världsmédborgarrörelsen*) have navigated in time based on a reactopic orientation: In what ways did X develop a utopia as a reaction to an imagined dystopia?

Further research should also try to grasp similarities and differences between isms in the cosmopolitan ism-cluster. For example, the cosmopolitan project of mondialism functioned as a reaction towards contemporary economic globalization and internationalisms, and questions to examine going forward are: What main differences and similarities can be found in key cosmopolitan concepts within projects for economic globalization, projects for internationalism and projects for mondialism? It is also of interest to use the method of conceptual history to find out at which main moments' and areas' deeper contradictions developed between the patriot and the cosmopolitan, with the breakthrough of nationalism as a contextual frame of reference.

Several studies within this project have examined the creation of identities (linked to citizenship, statelessness, borders and belonging to a geographical/political area) and from those studies two main questions have arisen: From which autonomous political subject-position is it possible for the ones who are lacking a state citizenship to develop a cosmopolitan citizenship? Which examples from the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> centuries can be found?

#### **5. Dissemination of the results of the project within and outside the research community**



The results in this research project have been disseminated mainly through articles in peer reviewed- scholarly journals and chapters in books. The larger project, a monograph by a doctoral student, has received media attention in popular science forums.

Within the academic community, results have been disseminated (and developed) at national and international conferences, one arranged within the project. Conferences and chapters in books have been in both English and Swedish, and books and articles have mainly been in English. In other words, the results have been available internationally. It should also be highlighted that in *Ideas in History*:7, which is co-edited by Lettevall, several universities and colleges in the Nordic countries collaborated in giving perspectives on the Baltic Sea area as a historical, cultural, and social space. Furthermore, the work with the monograph by the PhD-student has been presented several times at universities and research networks in Sweden, but also internationally through a conference in Paris. It was planned to present results from the thesis in several international forums, but due to the pandemic (covid), those plans could not be completed.

The monograph, which deals with the issue of war and peace based on a problematization of cosmopolitanism, was very topical since it was published in a tense world situation (not least with the war in Ukraine and an intensified debate about nuclear weapons) and received attention in mass media.

### **Monographs:**

Gustafsson, Jenny. (2022). *Drömmen om en gränslös fred: Världsmedborgarrörelsens reaktopi, 1949-1968* (Doctoral dissertation). Möklinta: Gidlunds förlag. Open access: <http://urn.kb.se/resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:sh:diva-48820>

### **Anthologies:**

Lettevall, Rebecka., Somsen, Geert & Widmalm, Sven. (Eds.). (2012). *Neutrality in Twentieth-Century Europe: Intersections of Science, Culture, and Politics after the First World War*. New York: Routledge (partly within the project)

Lettevall, Rebecka. & Petrov, Kristian. (Eds.). (2014). *Critique of Cosmopolitan Reason: Timing and Spacing the Concept of World Citizenship*. Oxford: Peter Lang Publishing Group

### **An example of a review:**

Björkman, John. Review in *Lychnos* ISSN 0076-1648. (2015): "Critique of cosmopolitan reason. Timing and spacing the concept of world citizenship". (pp. 283–285), (Eds. R. Lettevall & K. Petrov). (2014). Bern: Peter Lang

### **Articles:**

Petrov, Kristian. (2013). "Russia in the European Home?: Convergence, Cosmopolitanism and Cosmism in Late Soviet Europeanisation". *Europe-Asia Studies*, 65(2), 321–346

Petrov, Kristian. (2014). "The Concept of Transition in Transition: Comparing the Post-Communist use of the Concept of Transition with that found in Soviet Ideology", *Baltic Worlds*, 7(1), 29–41. Open access: <http://urn.kb.se/resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:sh:diva-24289>

Petrov, Kristian. (2015). "Att förutsäga framtiden – och förlösa den: En undersökning av den postkommunistiska transitologins idéhistoria och tidsuppfattning", *Nordisk Østforum*, vol. 29, nr 4: 387–417 (31 s.).



ISSN: 0801 7220. Open access: [https://www.idunn.no/nof/2015/04/att\\_frutsga\\_framtiden\\_-\\_och\\_frlsa\\_den\\_en\\_underskning](https://www.idunn.no/nof/2015/04/att_frutsga_framtiden_-_och_frlsa_den_en_underskning)

Lettevall, Rebecka. (2015). "En kritik av det kosmopolitiska förnuftet?: Om relevansen av Kants kosmopolitism på 2000-talet", *Studier i Pædagogisk Filosofi*, 4(2), 81–93. Open access: 10.7146/spf.v4i2.22421 (DOI)

#### Chapters in textbooks:

Gustafsson, Jenny. (2019). "Värnpliktsvägran för världens skull: Världsmedborgarrörelsen och visionen om medborgarskap för fred". In A. Burman & B. Holmqvist (Eds.), *Det lyckliga femtiotalet: sexualitet, politik och motstånd : en vänbok till Lena Lennerhed*. (pp. 269–284), Stockholm: Symposion Brutus Östlings bokförlag/ Södertörns högskola, Institutionen för historia och samtidsstudier, Idéhistoria

Gustafsson, Jenny. (2022). "Kosmopolit". In J. Hansson & K. Savin (Eds.), *Svenska begreppshistorier*. (pp. 271–282), Stockholm: Fri Tanke

Kaveh, Shamal. (2011). "Arendts storstädning av det politiska rummet". In U. Björk & A. Burman (Eds.), *Konsten att handla – konsten att tänka: Hannah Arendt om det politiska*. (pp. 47–64), Stockholm: AxlBooks. Open access: <http://su.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2:505888>

Lettevall, Rebecka (2011). "On the historicity of concepts: The examples of patriotism and cosmopolitanism in Ellen Key". In H. Ruin & A. Ers (Eds.), *Rethinking Time: Essays on history, memory and representation*. (pp. 179–188), Stockholm: Södertörn Philosophical Studies 9

Lettevall, Rebecka. (2012). "Virtues and vices: Eco-Ethical perspectives on patriotism and cosmopolitanism". In P. Kemp & N. Hashimoto (Eds.), *Eco-Ethica: Re-thinking ethics today*, vol 2. (pp. 53–63), Tokyo/Copenhagen

Lettevall, Rebecka (with Somsen & Widmalm). (2012). "Introduction", In R. Lettevall., G. Somsen & S. Widmalm (Eds.), *Neutrality in Twentieth-Century Europe: Intersections of Science, Culture, and Politics after the First World War*. (pp.1–19 ), New York: Routledge

Lettevall, Rebecka. (2012). "Neutrality and Humanitarianism: Fridtjof Nansen and the Nansen Passports". In R. Lettevall., G. Somsen & S. Widmalm (Eds.), *Neutrality in Twentieth-Century Europe: Intersections of Science, Culture, and Politics after the First World War*. (pp. 316–336), New York: Routledge

Lettevall, Rebecka. (2013). "Cosmopolitanism in practice: Perspectives on the Nansen Passports". In U. Ziemer och S.P. Roberts (Eds.), *East European Diasporas, migration and cosmopolitanism*. (pp. 13–24), London: Routledge

Lettevall, Rebecka & Petrov, Kristian. (2014). "Toward a Critique of Cosmopolitan Reason". In R. Lettevall & K. Petrov (Eds.), *Critique of Cosmopolitan Reason: Timing and Spacing the Concept of World Citizenship*. (pp. 3–34), Oxford: Peter Lang Publishing Group

Lettevall, Rebecka. (2014). "The Nature of War and the Culture of Peace". In P. Kemp & N. Hashimoto (Eds.), *Eco-Ethica: Re-thinking ethics today*, vol 3. (pp. 39–51), Tokyo/Copenhagen

Lettevall, Rebecka. (2015). "En kritik av det kosmopolitiska förnuftet? Om samtidsrelevansen av Kants kosmopolitism", *Studier i Paedagogisk Filosofi*, årg 4: nr 2. (pp. 81–93), Odense



Lettevall, Rebecka. (2020). "The Stronger the Patriots – the weaker the Migrants: Cosmopolitan Perspectives". In E. Berhanu Gebre, D. Župarić-Iljić and M. Chrom Jacobsen: *Cosmopolitanism, Migration and Universal Human Rights*. (pp. 33–44), Springer

Lettevall, Rebecka. (2020). "Cosmopolitanism as Utopia". In O. Hemer, M. Povrzanovic Frykman, P-M Ristilampi: *Conviviality at the Crossroads: The poetics and Politics of Everyday Encounters*. (pp. 89–103). Cham: Palgrave Macmillan

Lettevall, Rebecka. (2022). "Fred". In J. Hansson & K. Savin (Eds.), *Svenska begreppshistorier*. (pp. 153–164), Stockholm: Fri Tanke

Petrov, Kristian. (2015). "Transition' in Hindsight: 1990s Transitology as an Object of Intellectual History". In B. Törnquist-Plewa, N. Bernsand & E. Narvselius (Eds.), *Beyond Transition? Memory and Identity Narratives in Eastern and Central Europe*, CFE Conference Papers Series 7. (pp. 11–22), Lund: Centrum för Europaforskning, Lunds universitet (ISSN: 1654-2185)

### **Five most important conferences**

Petrov, K & Lettevall, R. "Cosmopolitanism in a Wider Context: Conceptualizing Past and Present. An international, Multi-disciplinary Conference at Södertörn University and the Nobel Museum. Keynote lectures and panel sessions. Organized by Center for Baltic and East European Studies at Södertörn University, Nobel Museum in Stockholm and the research project East of Cosmopolis. Södertörn university, Stockholm, 24-26/11 2011.

Petrov, K. "A European Home for Russia?: The Late Soviet Conceptualization of Globalization". In session Globalizations – Conceptualizations. Part II (Chair Hans Erik Næss, September 14). At International conference: Conceptualizing the World. Oslo University, Oslo, 13-16/9 2011.

Lettevall, R & Petrov K. "Critique of Cosmopolitan Reason: Timing and Spacing the Concept of Cosmopolitanism". In session *Global and Cosmopolitan Concepts* (Chair: Hans Erich Bödeker, August 30). At The 16th International Conference on the History of Concepts: Concepts on the Move. Cross-Cultural and Cross-Disciplinary Transfers, Entanglements, Receptions, Translations and Redefinitions in Conceptual History. Bilbao University, Bilbao and San Millán de la Cogolla (La Rioja), 29–31/8 2013.

Lettevall, R & Petrov K. "Öster om Kosmopolis: Världsmedborgaren och den papperslösa paradoxen". In session 1 (Chair: Anna Larsson, September 26). At Idéhistoria på gång. Umeå University, Umeå, 25-26/9 2014.

Gustafsson, J. "The Soldier and World Citizenship: The World Citizen Movement in Sweden and its mobilization within a transnational space, 1948-1968". In Session Transnational Political Mobilizations, (Chair: Irene Hermann, June 20). At 6th International PhD Conference of the Association for Political History, Centre d'histoire de Sciences Po, Paris, 20-22/6 2018.