



## SCIENTIFIC FINAL REPORT

Regnr Östersjöstiftelsen: 2016-0063

Project manager: Jonna Lappalainen

**Project title:** Collective Phronesis. A survey of collectivity, decision making and professional considerations in the welfare professions in Sweden and Germany

### 1. Purpose of the project

The research project was motivated by the hypothesis that the market-oriented transformations of the welfare society in recent decades had influenced welfare workers in such a way that previously developed collective working methods were replaced by working methods characterized by hierarchical organizations and focus on individual achievements and merits. The purpose was to investigate how professionals in the welfare professions related to and understood collective structures, what role collective structures could be considered to play in the practice of the profession, i.e., for working conditions or quality of welfare services. The project focused on police officers and teachers. In order to detect and investigate those collective structures that are imbedded (and thus taken for granted) in societal contexts and norms, the project also included a contrastive perspective on the situation in Germany. (Here the focus was on the teaching profession)

The focus of the project was both philosophical and empirical: We aimed at examining how professionals understood and related to collective structures; how they relied on them in decision-making, actions and considerations, and to conceptually-theoretically clarify how actions, decisions and considerations can actually be described and understood collectively. An important starting point was to approach the issue with the premise that collective structures could constitute a strength or a capacity for knowledge (phronesis).

The project was carried out in three parts. Sub-studies 1 and 2 were two different philosophical concept-studies based on the project's common empirical material to obtain a deeper and more thorough understanding of how collective structures are perceived, how they operate, and in what sense they have reality. Sub-study 1 focused on individuals' attitudes to individual and collective rationality and how these were reflected in actions, decisions and considerations from the perspective of existential philosophy (Sartre, Beauvoir). Sub-study 2 focused on on the concept of collective action and intentions from a phenomenological perspective taking its starting point in concrete situations that occur in



professional practices. The studies were designed in such a way that they were partly carried out jointly in order for us to enrich each other. The purpose of sub-study 3 was to carry out a more in-depth close study of a number of selected work teams (teachers) in order to investigate how collective structures and working methods arise and are organized. Parts of theoretical and empirical investigations in sub-study 3 were conducted with the other two sub-studies.

## **2. The three most important results of the project and what conclusions can be drawn from them**

In the philosophical-theoretical sub-studies' work to clarify what collective structures are and how people interact with them, it became clear that **collective structures co-exist at several different interacting levels**. These collectives can thus be constituted, maintained in widely different ways, and they have different goals and different rationalities that often differ from each other. In the survey of professionals, it became clear that the individual often moves between different collective structures, and that these often are arranged hierarchically. However, the individual's organization in the collective is also affected by the situation, place, and individual aspects.

A further conclusion is that both teachers and police experienced that in recent decades they have experienced increased detailed regulation and managerial control, and that this has occasionally created **a fragmentation of work that has changed professionals' views on cooperation, professionalism, and community**. It emerged, however, that this did not primarily manifest itself in a conflict between the collective and the individual. Instead, it became clear that the increased governance led to conflicts between different levels of collective structures, e.g. the teaching team vs. the school management group, the police patrol vs. the police department. Our conclusion was thus that the collective work is still of great importance, but that the collective structures have changed in character. Another important result was that the increased fragmentation of the everyday life of police officers and teachers has affected work in a way that is perceived as limiting and that this was often perceived as a deterioration of, and distancing from, community service, and in some cases also a sense of meaninglessness and abandonment on the part of individual professionals.



A third conclusion was that the professionals considered **that both conscious and less conscious, such as emotional or embodied dimensions of collective intentionality and rationality constitute an essential, if not fundamental, aspect of both police officers 'and teachers' views on the possibility of good professional practice.** In both professions, there is an awareness of the importance and at the same time ambivalence of creating consensus in action and decision-making. This appears in governing documents, work routines, training procedures and in expressed approaches. The emphasis on consensus was particularly strong among police officers, but also occurred among different groups of teachers in a team. There was an awareness among both professions that this consensus could also lead to negative aspects such as informal decision-making structures and conservatism.

### **3. The project's contribution to the international research frontline**

The research activities of the project have from the very start been a part of international front-line research as concerns the philosophy of collective action and with a particular focus on aspects in working life. We have arranged two international conferences on selected themes with invited scholars, by way of which we have engaged in dialogue with researchers in the Baltic Sea Region and from the rest of the world. The results have been published in 7 articles in international journals/books and a coming dissertation at Södertörn University (spring 2023). The project members have also presented their thoughts and results at around 15 international conferences and Nordic-Baltic network-meetings during the project time.

In police research and pedagogy, we were able to add an in-depth concept analysis to existing discussions with the help of philosophical perspectives, but also, based on our empirical studies, highlight new material on perspectives from within practice. In a philosophical context, the project's starting point in existing professional practice meant an in-depth and concretized understanding of collective structures. This in turn has led to increased insights into collective rationality and collective intentionality. One of the things that characterizes our results is that we show that, and in what ways, collective structures have a reality, not only in action, but also in decision-making and considerations. This is an essential insight because philosophy, traditionally, has primarily studied these on the basis of individual rationality. The combination of philosophical concept analysis and empirical



studies of the apprehension of collective structures have consequently contributed to front line research by way of academic discussions and publications in journals.

Through the project, collaborative contacts on collectivity have been established with researchers at Europa University Flensburg, University of Bremen, Nord University in Bodö, Norway and European Humanity University in Vilnius, Lithuania.

#### **4. New research questions that the project has led to**

A central research question evolving in the course of the project has been the importance of collective identity that public servants gave voice to in the empirical material. This has led to further research applications about the importance of professional pride as an expression for a collective identity and the role of affective structures in police work and police education.

Another central research question arising out of the project is how professional education are supposed to address the quest for conformity in rationality and intentions in relation to the idea of public servants as representative for the society as a whole. In public service professions the question of collective structures highlights the tension between the two fundamental goals of public service institutions: to preserve the prevailing societal functions and at the same time affirm and include all citizens in an ever-changing society.

The significance of collective structures is often treated as psychological or behavioral-scientific questions. This significance is not sufficiently considered as part of a professional culture or part of a political society. In line with our results, which show the inevitable and inevitable role of collective structures in public service professions, it would be interesting to investigate how collective structures are thematized and they could be thematized in a more structured way in vocational education.

#### **5. The contribution of the research to the knowledge of the Baltic Sea Region and Eastern Europe**

In addition to phenomenological and existential philosophical perspectives, this study also included theoretical studies of activity theory that include a distinct collectivist perspective on organization and work. The activity theory, with its foreground figures Vygotsky and Leontiev, was developed in Russian and Soviet contexts, and has since been developed in



Scandinavian pedagogy (Engeström et al.). The preconditions for the project's empirical investigation were considerably deepened through this historical review of the founders of activity theory. It created a greater awareness of the historical roots of Swedish pedagogy and contemporary blindness, as well as insights into the school systems' anchoring (through both practice and governing documents) in their national contexts that deepened the comparative study.

The study's deliberate transnational (theoretical and empirical) approach created good opportunities to discover and see differences in teachers' attitudes towards and understanding of collective structures and led to a deeper understanding of the phenomenon in an international. Yet, the empirical work was limited due to the pandemic. It still became clear that the German experience of the country being divided into two different political systems, has led to a greater and more pronounced awareness of different levels and forms of collectives in existing pedagogy and teaching practice, which is also evident in German research on education and the school system. The Swedish school system is not characterized in the same way by political upheavals. Instead, the market orientation that began in the 1980s appears as a clear break with a nationally oriented and self-sufficient educational organization. With the help of the present research results, we have thus shown the importance of knowledge about the historical and political conditions for collective structures, and that this knowledge is essential for understanding the phenomenon in a broader context. We also consider the question of national conditions for collective structures to be an issue that should be further investigated.

In the project work, a structured dialogue was created with researchers from Flensburg and Bremen, in addition, a collaboration was developed with European Humanities University (Vilnius, Lithuania) and North University in Bodö. These contacts give good opportunities to further investigate collective structures in relation to national governing documents and practices.

## **6. Dissemination of the results of the project within and outside the research community**



**Organized conferences:**

“*Collective Phronesis? An investigation of collective judgement and professional knowledge*”, International Symposium, Södertörn University, 28-29 mars, 2018, *organized and presentations*. Two days conference with 5 invited speakers from three different countries, 18 participants.

“Toward an Asymmetrical Ethics: Power, Relations, and the Diversity of Subjectivities”, Södertörn University, November 13-15, 2019. Two days conference with 12 invited speakers, 50 participants from 15 different countries.

**5 most important conference papers:**

”Collective Phronesis”, Lappalainen Jonna & Schwarz, Eva; ; School of Social Practices: UNILOG 2018, Vichy 21 juni 2018, France, 2017.

”Situated practice - Bodily dimensions of professional knowledge within Early Childhood Education in Sweden.”, Bergkvist, Anna-Mia & Schwarz, Eva; "Transnational perspective on school and education", Jahrestagung der Kommission Schforschung und Didaktik, Flensburg University, 10 September, Germany, 2019.

"Collective activities? Different ways of conducting design studies using concept within Activity Theory, Learning Activity and the perspectives of Practical Knowledge", Bergkvist, Anna-Mia; The 8th Nordic ISCAR Conference, Cultural-Historical Activity Theory in Research and Practice: A Nordic Approach, Trondheim, Norway, 18 June, 2019. .

“Collective action and judgement”, Schwarz, Eva: Annual meeting of the Nordic Society of Phenomenology; NOSP 2019, April 2019, University of Copenhagen, Denmark.

”Att verka i gruppens dynamik och i organisationens stagnation”, Lappalainen, Jonna: ”*Tillit, styrformer och professionellt omdöme*”, Södertörns University, 8-9 December 2020.

**Articles and chapters in books:**

Bergkvist, Anna-Mia, (2020), ”Öppna eller stängda skolor – en fråga även om bildning och lärande”, (with Helena Eriksson); Nättidningsskrift SoS Skola och Samhälle

<https://www.skolaochsamhalle.se/flode/skola/helena-eriksson-och-anna-mia-bergkvist-oppna-eller-stangda-skolor-en-fraga-aven-om-bildning-och-larande/>



Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Inledning", in *Aspiranten och erfarenheten. Polisens praktiska kunskap*, Södertörn Studies in Practical Knowledge 11, Huddinge: Södertörns högskola, 2021. (p. 9-30). <http://sh.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:1557091/FULLTEXT02.pdf>

Hjertström Lappalainen, J. (2020) "The Formation of Thinking", *Confero*, Vol. 7, no. 1, 2020 (pp. 10-33). Retrieved from <http://www.confero.ep.liu.se/issues/2020/v7/i1/a02/confero20v7i1a02.pdf>

Hjertström Lappalainen, J. (2020). Det kontrollerade tänkandet. In: *En plats för tänkande: Essäer om universitetet och filosofin* (pp. 213–230). Huddinge: Södertörns högskola. Retrieved from <http://urn.kb.se/resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:sh:diva-41981>

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna & Wojahn, Daniel, "Skrivande som metod för kritisk reflektion över den egna yrkespraktiken", *Normkritisk pedagogik*, (red Björkman & Bromseth), Stockholm: Studentlitteratur 2019.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Praktikerns blick som forskningsmaterial – Existensfilosofiska perspektiv på praktisk kunskap" i *Att utforska praktisk kunskap*, (Gunnarson red), Södertörn Studies in Practical Knowledge, utkommer 2019. <http://sh.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:1377228/FULLTEXT01.pdf>

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "När hälsan blev norm" i *Existens och psykisk hälsa. Om hur liv och levnad förhåller sig till hälsa och ohälsa*. Dan Stiwne (red), Stockholm: Studentlitteratur, 2018.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna "Utsatthetens lidande. Förmågan att lida som en del av soldatens praktiska kunskap", *Uppdrag militär – perspektiv på militärt yrkeskunnande*, Victor Tillberg, Lotta (red) Centrum för studier av militär och samhälle, Stockholm: Svenskt militärhistoriskt bibliotek, 2018. <https://www.csms.se/upl/files/163031.pdf>

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Konstens roll i vårddarbetet ur ett existentiellt perspektiv, *Konsten en värdeskapande faktor i vårdmiljö. En seminarierapport från konstenheten i västra götlandsregionen 2017*. Region västra Götaland 2018. <https://sh.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:1276291/FULLTEXT02.pdf>

Schwarz, Eva (with James McGuirk), "Studies in practical knowledge: who, how and what.", In: *Practical knowledge. Exploring the Professional Lifeworld in Education and Research*, Carl Cederberg, Kåre Fuglseth, Edwin van der Zande (eds.), Brill, (in press)

Schwarz, Eva. "To step into the life of others. Professional action, empathy, and an ethics of engagement", in Ferarrello, Susi, Englander, Magnus (ed). *Empathy and Ethics*, Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield, 2022.

Schwarz, Eva. "To act as one body? Collective and Embodied Judgement Within Professional Action and Education, in: *Embodiment and Professional Education: Body*,





Practice, Pedagogy / (ed) Stephen Loftus; Elizabeth Anne Kinsella, Singapore: Springer, 2021, p. 27-42

Schwarz, Eva, "Vi poliser? Om vänskap, arbetskamratskap och pluralitet, in Hjertröm Lappalainen, Jonna (red), *Aspiranten och erfarenheten. Polisens praktiska kunskap*, Södertörn Studies in Practical Knowledge 11, Huddinge: Södertörns högskola, 2021 (p. 289-316). <http://sh.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:1557091/FULLTEXT02.pdf>

Schwarz, E., & Hjertröm Lappalainen, J. (2020). Collective Phronesis? An Investigation of Collective Judgement and Professional Action. In *The Logic of Social Practices* (pp. 23–35). Cham: Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-37305-4\\_2](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-37305-4_2) Schwarz, Eva: "Den ständige nybörjaren. Om reflektion och praktisk kunskap", i *Att utforska praktisk kunskap*, (Gunnarson red), Södertörn Studies in Practical Knowledge, Huddinge 2019. <http://sh.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:1377228/FULLTEXT01.pdf>

Schwarz, Eva, "Review of Simon Høffding. A phenomenology of musical absorption", *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology* 50 (2019) 249–272.

#### **Anthology:**

Hjertröm Lappalainen, Jonna (red), *Aspiranten och erfarenheten. Polisens praktiska kunskap*, Södertörn Studies in Practical Knowledge 11, Huddinge: Södertörns högskola, 2021. <http://sh.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:1557091/FULLTEXT02.pdf>

#### **Teaching:**

Anna-Mia Bergkvist: Teaching at teachers education (Södertörn university) about 60 hours yearly 2018-2021 on subjects related to professional judgement and collaboration.

Jonna Lappalainen: Teaching at the police education (Södertörn University) about 80 hours yearly 2017-2021 in courses related to professional reflection, judgement, decision-making and collaboration.

Jonna Lappalainen: Teaching police officers in supervision (Swedish Police Authority) about 40 hours yearly, 2017-2021.

Jonna Lappalainen: 2018 Teaching 20 hours at Ph D level course (Södertörn University) on collectivity in working life.





Jonna Lappalainen: 2021-22, Teaching 80 hours at the Liberal arts program (Södertörn University) on collectivity as a research subject.

Eva Schwarz: Teaching at the police education (Södertörn University) about 80 hours yearly 2018-2021 in courses related to professional reflection, judgement, decision-making and collaboration.

Eva Schwarz: Teaching police officers in supervision (Swedish Police Authority) about 20 hours yearly, 2018-2021.

Eva Schwarz: 2018 Teaching 20 hours at Ph D level course (Södertörn University) on collectivity in working life.

Eva Schwarz: 2020 Teaching 80 hours on the masters level (Södertörn University) on research and collectivity.

### **Supervision**

Eva Schwarz: Anna-Mia Bergkvist PhD project part of present project.

Jonna Lappalainen: Mani Shutzbergs PH D project, related to collectivity in medical care.

Jonna Lappalainen: 1 masters thesis related to collectivity.

Eva Schwarz: 1 masters thesis related to collectivity.

### **Popular Science publications:**

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, ”Den drömmande anden i ögonblicket”, *Tidvatten : Festskrift till Hans Ruin*, (Marcia Sà Cavalcante Shuback & Staffan Ericsson ed.) Södertörn Philosophical Studies, Vol.30, 2021 (s. 53–60).

Schwarz, Eva, (2020) ”At the very core of the Belarusian uprising is a moral Trauma”, Interview with Tatiana Shchytsova, *Baltic Worlds*, <http://balticworlds.com/at-the-very-core-of-the-belarusian-uprising-is-a-moral-trauma/>



Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Arendt, Schön, Dewey och tänkandet i praktiken. Ett samtal med Jonna Lappalainen" <https://soundcloud.com/user-506067340-541313596/hantverksfilosoferna-jonna-lappalainen-praktisk-kunskap>

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Sanning enligt Kierkegaard" <https://podtail.com/podcast/talking-to-experts/talking-to-experts-16-sanning-enligt-kierkegaard-me/>

**Other forms of not mentioned disseminations such as presentations and debates**

Bergkvist, Anna- Mia, "Lärares kollektiva praktiska kunskaper – klokskap, känsla och ansvar", March 2021, Stockholm University

Lappalainen, Jonna, "Kollektiv kunskap – styrka eller social kontroll", *Folkbildarforum*, Linköping, 27 April 2021.

Lappalainen, Jonna (with Susanne Dodillet och Sverker Lundin), "Högskolepedagogik som politiskt styrmedel" ; *Forskning om högre utbildning*, Örebro University, 20 May, 2021.

Lappalainen, Jonna (with Bengt Bergman), "What makes a police officer proud?"; *8th Nordic Police Research Conference*, Helsinki, 16 June 2021

Anna-Mia Bergkvist, Jonna Lappalainen & Eva Schwarz) "Kollektivt omdöme i yrkeslivet", Teachers education, Södertörn University, 8 June 2021.

Lappalainen, Jonna: "Berättelsens betydelse och logik som empiriskt material; några filosofiska exempel", föredrag vid konferensen vid konferensen *Fortellninger og praktisk kunskap*, North University, Bodö Norway, 13 February 2020.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, Panelsamtal om Normkritik, Teachers education, Södertörn University, 23 April, 2019.

Bergkvist, Anna-Mia, "Att lära ut yrkeskunnande – går det? Den svåra konsten att handleda." vid avslutningskonferens för Övningskoleprojektet vid Huddinge kommun, 7 May, 2019.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Materialities and Practical Knowledge", Föreläsning vid Royal Institute of Art, Stockholm, 7 May, 2019.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Hållbarhet ur ett praktisk kunskap-perspektiv", Föreläsning vid Karolinska institutet, Solna, 8 May, 2019.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Erfarenheter av samverkan", Teachers education, Södertörn University (2018)



Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, Föredrag "Utsatthet och lidande, militär praktisk kunskap" CSMS, Royal Institute of Technology, 16 January, 2018.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, Presentation av "Utsatthet och lidande, militär praktisk kunskap" Department of Philosophy, Turku University, Turku, Finland, 29 January, 2018.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Production, Perception and the Practical Knowledge of Art", University of Arts, Craft and Design, Stockholm, 30 January, 2018.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Tänkande som generisk färdighet", Workshop *Filosofin och universitetet*, Södertörn University, 16 March, 2018.

Schwarz, Eva (with Beatriz Lindqvist): "Exploring the phenomenology of Whiteness in a Swedish Preschool Class"; Teachers education, Långholmen, 4. June 2018; Stockholm.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, Presentation av "När hälsan blev norm", Sällskapet för existentiell psykoterapi, 20 January, 2017.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna (with Bornemark, Jonna), "Det kidnappade kvalitetsbegreppet", Södertörn University 5 September, 2017.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Kollektiv praktisk kunskap", föreläsning på masterutbildning i ABM (arkiv, bibliotek, museologi), Uppsala University, 10 October, 2017.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Existentiella perspektiv på praktisk kunskap", Stockholm University of the Arts, 6 November, 2017.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, "Att utvärdera samverkan" föredrag på Arenaträff om cooperation, Unilink, Södertörns University, 8 November, 2017.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, Panel on democracy and education, konferensen *Folk & bildning*, Kulturhuset. 6 November, 2017.

Hjertström Lappalainen, Jonna, Panel on cooperation and intercommunion, Kvalitetskonferens Södertörns University 15 November, 2017.

Schwarz, Eva: "Mellan individ och gemenskap", Heldag om förskoleforskning, Södertörns högskola, 15 november 2019.

Schwarz, Eva: "Practical knowledge at its research areas", Seminar on the study of professions and practical knowledge in Stockholm, 30 September 2019 at Södertörn University.



“On Being with Others: Asymmetric ethics and the idea of the community”, Toward an Asymmetrical Ethics: Power, Relations, and the Diversity of Subjectivities, Conference, Södertörns högskola, November 13-15, 2019

Schwarz, Eva “Praktiskt kunskap”, Forskningsdag Bibliotek Väst, Alingsås, 6 november 2019.

Schwarz, Eva “Practical knowledge at its research areas”, Seminar on the study of professions and practical knowledge in Stockholm, 30 September 2019 at Södertörn University Stockholm

Schwarz, Eva “Collective action and judgement”, Annual meeting of the Nordic Society of Phenomenology; NOSP 2019, April 2019, University of Copenhagen, Denmark,

Schwarz, Eva “On being with others. Collective action and judgement in education”, A Philosophy of Education Symposium: Why philosophy of education matters in present times, 13 April 2019, Stockholm University,

Schwarz, Eva”Om Kollektiv kunskap”, Högre Seminariet i Pedagogiskt Arbete, 2 april 2019, Linköpings Universitet

Schwarz, Eva” Collective Phronesis? An introduction”, Symposium, Collective Phronesis, 28 mars 2019, Södertörns högskola.

Schwarz, Eva ”Mellan begrepp och liv. Vad händer när vi mäter akademisk framgång?”, Symposium, Det akademiska skrivandets politiska ekonomi den 21 februari 2019, Göteborgs Universitet